UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

IN RE:

MEMORANDUM DECISION

AND ORDER

TERRORIST ATTACKS ON SEPTEMBER 11, 2001

03 MDL 1570 (GBD) (SN)

----X

This document relates to:

Burnett v. Islamic Republic of Iran, No. 15-cv-09903 (GBD)(SN)

GEORGE B. DANIELS, United States District Judge:

Certain *Burnett* Plaintiffs moved for partial final default judgment against the Islamic Republic of Iran, the Islamic Revolutionary Guard Corps, and the Central Bank of the Islamic Republic of Iran (collectively, the "Iran Defendants"). (ECF Nos. 9733, 9945, 10027, 10045.)¹ As non-U.S. nationals, these Plaintiffs cannot bring claims against the Iran Defendants under 28 U.S.C. § 1605A(c). (*See* ECF No. 9666, at 1). They therefore ask this Court to hold the Iran Defendants liable under state tort law. Additionally, two *Burnett* Plaintiffs asked the Court to treat them as functional equivalents of immediate family members to the 9/11 decedents. (ECF No. 9945).

Before this Court is Magistrate Judge Sarah Netburn's January 13, 2025 Report and Recommendation ("the Report"), recommending that this Court: 1) grant Plaintiff Rui Zheng's motion based on the Intentional Infliction of Emotional Distress ("IIED") claim under Virginia law and award her solatium damages as set forth in Exhibit A; 2) grant the *Burnett* Plaintiffs' motions based on IIED claims under New York law and award them solatium damages as set forth

¹Unless otherwise indicated, all ECF citations included herein refer to documents filed on the 9/11 multidistrict litigation docket. *See In re Terrorist Attacks on September 11, 2001*, No. 03-md-1570 (GBD) (SN).

in Exhibit B; 3) deny without prejudice certain Burnett Plaintiffs' motions; and 4) grant Plaintiffs Solomon Gayle's and Erica Zimmerman's motions and award them solatium damages as set forth in Exhibit C. (Report, ECF No. 10665, at 18-19, 22-23.) Magistrate Judge Netburn advised the parties that failure to file timely objections to the Report would constitute a waiver of those objections on appeal. (Id. at 24.) No party has filed objections.

LEGAL STANDARDS

A court "may accept, reject, or modify, in whole or in part, the findings or recommendations" set forth in a magistrate judge's report. 28 U.S.C. § 636(b)(1)(C). The court must review de novo the portions of a magistrate judge's report to which a party properly objects. Id. Portions of a magistrate judge's report to which no or "merely perfunctory" objections are made are reviewed for clear error. See Edwards v. Fischer, 414 F. Supp. 2d 342, 346-47 (S.D.N.Y. 2006) (citations omitted). Clear error is present only when "upon review of the entire record, [the court is] left with the definite and firm conviction that a mistake has been committed." United States v. Snow, 462 F.3d 55, 72 (2d Cir. 2006) (citation and internal quotation marks omitted).

Having reviewed Magistrate Judge Netburn's Report for clear error and finding none, this Court ADOPTS the Report in full.

II. MAGISTRATE JUDGE NETBURN CORRECTLY CONCLUDED THAT **JURISDICTION EXISTS**

Magistrate Judge Netburn concluded that the Court has both subject matter and personal jurisdiction over the Iran Defendants. (See Report at 4-8). Magistrate Judge Netburn properly noted that certain Burnett Plaintiffs hold a default judgment against the Iran Defendants as to liability. (See Report at 2 (citing Order of Judgment, ECF No. 3443; In re Terrorist Attacks on Sept. 11, 2001, 2011 WL 13244047, at *2-36 (S.D.N.Y. Dec. 22, 2011) ("2011 Decision").) In

Page 3 of 17

its 2011 Decision, this Court found Iran liable for facilitating the 9/11 attacks under the FSIA exception provide under 28 U.S.C. § 1605B(b). *See 2011 Decision*, 2011 WL 13244047, at *41.

As Magistrate Judge Netburn correctly noted, while "courts cannot take judicial notice of factual findings made in another case and rely on them 'for the truth of the matter asserted," (Report at 3 (citing Int'l Star Class Yacht Racing Ass'n v. Tommy Hilfiger U.S.A., Inc., 146 F.3d 66, 70 (2d Cir. 1998))), courts can, in the FSIA context, take judicial notice of decisions and review the underlying evidence, "thereby obviating the need for its 're-presentment." (Id. at 3–4 (citing Lee v. Islamic Republic of Iran, 518 F. Supp. 3d 475, 480 (D.D.C. 2021))). The underlying evidence from the 2011 Decision supports the conclusion that Iran's tortious acts—specifically, its provision of material support to al Qaeda—proximately caused the 9/11 attacks, and Plaintiffs' injuries by extension. (See Report at 4–6.) Therefore, Plaintiffs have established the applicability of the FSIA exception under 28 U.S.C. § 1605B(b), and this Court has subject-matter jurisdiction under 28 U.S.C. § 1330(a).

Once a court determines that subject matter jurisdiction exists over a foreign state under 28 U.S.C. § 1330(a), personal jurisdiction is straightforward, simply requiring valid service of process under 28 U.S.C. § 1608. See 28 U.S.C. § 1330(b). Magistrate Judge Netburn correctly found that Plaintiffs achieved service under 28 U.S.C. § 1608(a)(4) and 28 U.S.C. § 1608(b)(3). (See Report at 7–8.) Therefore, this Court has personal jurisdiction over Iran Defendants.

III. MAGISTRATE JUDGE NETBURN PROPERLY NOTED THAT THE IRAN DEFENDANTS DEFAULTED

Plaintiffs' effectuation of service triggered a sixty-day period for Iran Defendants to serve "an answer or other responsive pleading to the complaint." 28 U.S.C. § 1608(d). The Iran Defendants failed to do so, and the Clerk of Court entered a Certificate of Default against the Iran Defendants on December 5, 2016. Thus, Magistrate Judge Netburn did not err in finding that Iran

Page 4 of 17

defaulted in this action. (See Report at 8 (citing Certificate of Default, No. 15-cv-09903, ECF No. 67).)

IV. MAGISTRATE JUDGE NETBURN DID NOT ERR IN HOLDING THE IRAN DEFENDANTS LIABLE

First, Magistrate Judge Netburn correctly noted that non-U.S. nationals may bring claims through § 1605B(b) and under New York tort law. (*See* Report at 2 (citing *In re 9/11*, 2024 WL 4268663 (S.D.N.Y. Jan. 5, 2024) ("King R&R"), report and recommendation adopted by 2024 WL 1312504 (Mar. 26, 2024) ("King Opinion").)

When MDL courts preside over state law claims, they apply the choice-of-law rules "that would have been applied by a state court in the jurisdiction in which a case was filed." *Menowitz v. Brown*, 991 F.2d 36, 40 (2d Cir. 1993). Because Plaintiffs filed their action in this District, this Court looks to New York's choice-of-law rules. (*See* Report at 8–9.) As Magistrate Judge Netburn noted, this analysis boils down to an evaluation of the "place of the tort—i.e., the jurisdiction where the last event necessary to make the defendant liable occurred. (*See id.* at 9; *In re Sept. 11th Litig.*, 494 F. Supp. 2d 232, 239 (S.D.N.Y. 2007) (citing *Schultz v. Boy Scouts of Am.*, 65 N.Y.2d 189, 192 (1985))). Here, Magistrate Judge Netburn did not err in applying New York law to most of the *Burnett* Plaintiffs who suffered injuries in New York, and applying Virginia law to Ms. Zheng, whose parents suffered injuries in Virginia. (*See* Report at 9.)

A. WRONGFUL DEATH

Magistrate Judge Netburn did not err in holding the Iran Defendants liable to Plaintiffs for their wrongful death claims. (See Report at 9–10.) New York law imposes liability for (1) the "death of a human being" where (2) "a wrongful act, neglect or default ... caused the decedent's death," (3) the decedent's survivors "suffered pecuniary loss by reason of the decedent's death," and (4) a "personal representative" has been appointed to represent the decedent. Chamberlain v.

City of White Plains, 986 F. Supp. 2d 363, 398 (S.D.N.Y. 2013). Magistrate Judge Netburn properly concluded that the Burnett Plaintiffs' claims satisfy these elements, and the Iran Defendants are liable to them under New York's wrongful death statute. (See Report at 10.)

It was also appropriate for Magistrate Judge Netburn to grant Ms. Zheng's request to withdraw her wrongful death claims brought under Virginia statute. (See Report at 10-11.) The Court agrees with Magistrate Judge Netburn that Ms. Zheng's claim based on Virginia's survival statute should be denied without prejudice.

B. INTENTIONAL INFLICTION OF EMOTIONAL DISTRESS

Magistrate Judge Netburn did not err in holding the Iran Defendants liable for the Burnett Plaintiffs' IIED claims. (See Report at 11-18.) Under New York law, the tort of IIED "has four elements: (i) extreme and outrageous conduct; (ii) intent to cause, or disregard of a substantial probability of causing, severe emotional distress; (iii) a causal connection between the conduct and injury; and (iv) severe emotional distress." Howell v. N. Y. Post Co., 81 N.Y.2d 115, 121 (1993). Under Virginia law, the plaintiff must show the following four elements in order to successfully bring an IIED claim: (i) the wrongdoer's conduct was intentional or reckless; (ii) the conduct was outrageous or intolerable; (iii) there was a causal connection between the wrongdoer's conduct and the resulting emotional distress; and (iv) the resulting emotional distress was severe." Williams v. Agency, Inc., 997 F. Supp. 2d 409, 413-14 (E.D. Va. 2014) (citing Supervalu, Inc., et al. v. Johnson, 276 Va. 356, 666 S.E.2d 335, 343 (2008).)

Based on the evidence that the Plaintiffs have proffered—which the Iran Defendants have admitted is true by virtue of their default—the Burnett Plaintiffs have successfully established all four elements of their IIED claims under both New York and Virginia law. (See Report at 12-14.) Furthermore, Magistrate Judge Netburn did not err in determining that despite the "presence" and third person to recover under an IIED claim, the terrorism exception should apply here. (*See* Report at 14–18.) The 9/11 attacks were designed to cause severe emotional distress on the general public, and in particular, families of the victims. Despite not being present or not having contemporaneous perception of the Attacks, the *Burnett* Plaintiffs were very much the targets of the IIED tort. Additionally, the objectives to be achieved by imposing the "presence" requirement are already accomplished here: the 9/11 attacks were certainly intended to harm the third persons, and the *Burnett* Plaintiffs' claims of severe distress are genuine and limited. (*See* Report at 16–17, citing *Republic of Sudan v. Owens*, 194 A.3d 38, 43-44 (D.C. 2018).) Magistrate Judge Netburn properly applied New York and Virginia tort law to the *Burnett* Plaintiffs' IIED claims, establishing liability for the Iran Defendants here. This Court awards damages to family members of 9/11 victims according to an established framework developed for solatium claims. (*See* ECF No. 2623.)

C. FUNCTIONAL REQUIVALENT

Plaintiffs Solomon Gayle and Erica Zimmerman move for partial final default judgment as to solatium damages on the ground that their close relationships, respectively, with decedents Seilai Khoo and Kenneth William Basnicki, who were killed in the 9/11 attacks, merit a finding that Mr. Gayle was the functional equivalent of Ms. Khoo's spouse, and Ms. Zimmerman the functional equivalent of Mr. Basnicki's child. (Mot., ECF No. 9945).

A long-established framework exists for solatium damages awarded to immediate family members of those who perished in the 9/11 attacks. (*See* Mem. Decision & Order, ECF No. 2623.) In limited circumstances, solatium damages are extended to people who are functionally equivalent to immediate family. (Report at 19.) On October 31, 2016, with refinements on November 17,

Filed 03/03/25

2017, this Court adopted a framework for determining if a plaintiff is a functional equivalent of an immediate family member. (See R. & R., ECF No. 3363, adopted by Mem. Decision & Order, ECF No. 3384; R. & R., ECF No. 3676, adopted by Mem. Decision & Order, ECF No. 3795.)²

Magistrate Judge Netburn's Report correctly applied the long-established framework to Mr. Gayle's and Ms. Zimmerman's motions seeking solatium damages. (See Report at 19-22.) Mr. Gayle submitted a declaration wherein he extensively detailed his relationship with Ms. Khoo. (See Decl. of John M. Eubanks, ECF No. 9947, Ex. C (Decl. of Solomon Gayle).) The Report accurately describes the relationship between Mr. Gayle and Ms. Khoo and considers the relevant factors in evaluating whether their relationship is functionally equivalent to that of spouses. (See Report at 20-21.) Based upon a consideration of "the duration of [their] relationship, the degree of mutual financial dependence and investments in a common life together, the duration of cohabitation and the presence or absence of a formal engagement" (Mem. Of Law in Support of Mot., ECF No. 9946, at 19), this Court concludes that Magistrate Judge Netburn did not commit error, clear or otherwise, in recommending that Mr. Gayle be awarded \$12,500,000 as the functional equivalent of Ms. Khoo's spouse. (See Report at 21).

Ms. Zimmerman submitted a declaration wherein she extensively detailed her relationship with Mr. Basnicki, her stepfather. (See Decl. of John M. Eubanks, ECF No. 9947, Ex. D (Decl. of Erica Zimmerman).) The Report accurately describes the relationship between Ms. Zimmerman and Mr. Basnicki and considers the relevant factors in evaluating whether their relationship is functionally equivalent to that of parent and child. (See Report at 21–22.) Mr. Basnicki "provided for Erica's every need" and "filled every role in Erica's life that a father would fill" (Mem. of Law

7

² This Court has applied this framework on numerous occasions. (See, e.g., ECF Nos. 4175, 5154, 5950, 5951, 8286, 8288, 8289, 8293, 8947, and 9557.)

in Support of Mot., ECF No. 9946, at 24), and Ms. Zimmerman's biological father "spent very little time with [her] while she was growing up" and "ma[de] no meaningful contribution to [her] upbringing." (Id. at 24). Therefore, Magistrate Judge Netburn did not commit error, clear or otherwise, in recommending that Ms. Zimmerman be awarded \$8,500,000 as the functional equivalent of Mr. Basnicki's child. (See Report at 22).

D. OTHER PLAINTIFFS

Upon checking the following Plaintiffs' complaints and moving papers, the Court adopts in full Magistrate Judge Netburn's recommendation to deny without prejudice: 1) certain Plaintiffs' request for treble damages pursuant to the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333; 2) certain Plaintiffs which the Court does not have a record of; and 3) certain anonymous Plaintiffs who have not been properly substituted in this matter. (See Report at 19 n.6.)

V. **CONCLUSION**

The Burnett Plaintiffs' motion is DENIED in part without prejudice as to Ms. Zheng's wrongful death and survival claims; DENIED in part without prejudice as to certain Plaintiffs' request for treble damages pursuant to the Anti-Terrorism Act, 18 U.S.C. § 2333; DENIED in part without prejudice as to Plaintiffs Justin Michael Bennett, Joy Bennett, Angela Elizabeth Rogers, Keith Rogers, Joanna K. Wells; DENIED in part without prejudice as to Plaintiffs Keith Cudmore and Timothy John; and GRANTED in part in all other aspects. It is

ORDERED that service of process was properly effectuated upon the Iran Defendants under 28 U.S.C. § 1608(a)(4) and 28 U.S.C. § 1608(b)(3); and it is

ORDERED that this Court has subject matter and personal jurisdiction over the Plaintiffs' state law claims against the Iran Defendants under 28 U.S.C. §§ 1330(a) and 1605B(b); and it is

ORDERED that judgments as to liability are entered for the Plaintiffs on their IIED state law claims against the Iran Defendants as described in this Order; and it is

ORDERED that judgments as to liability are entered for the Plaintiffs on their wrongful death claims based on New York law against the Iran Defendants as described in this Order; and it is

ORDERED that partial final default judgment is entered on behalf of the Plaintiffs identified in Exhibits A, B, and C against the Iran Defendants; and it is

ORDERED that the Plaintiff identified in Exhibit A is awarded solutium damages as set forth therein; and it is

ORDERED that the Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit B are awarded solatium damages as set forth therein; and it is

ORDERED that the Plaintiffs identified in Exhibit C are awarded solatium damages as set forth therein; and it is

ORDERED that Plaintiffs receiving solatium damages identified in Exhibits A, B, and C are awarded prejudgment interest of 4.96 percent per annum, compounded annually, running from September 11, 2001 until the date of judgment; and it is

ORDERED that the Plaintiffs identified in Exhibits A, B, and C may submit future applications for punitive or other damages at a later date consistent with any future rulings of this Court; and it is

ORDERED that Plaintiffs not appearing in Exhibits A, B, and C may submit in later stages applications for damages awards to the extent they have not done so already.

The Clerk of Court is directed close the motions at:

- ECF Nos. 9733, 9945, 10027, and 10045 in 03-md-1570
- ECF No. 700, 746, 780, and 789 in 15-cv-9903
- ECF No. 147 in 19-cv-44

Dated:

New York, New York

SO ORDERED.

United States District Judge

Exhibit A

Case 1:03-md-01570-GBD-SN Document 10756 Filed 03/03/25 Page 12 of 17

EXHIBIT A NON-U.S. NATIONAL SOLATIUM - VIRGINIA IIED

		Claimant		
First	Middle	Last	Suffix	Nationality on 9/11
Rui		Zheng		China
Rui		Zheng		China

			9/11 Dec	edent			
First	Middle	Last	Suffix	Nationality on 9/11	Date of Death	9/11 Site	
Shuyin		Yang		China	9/11/2001	VA (AA77)	
Yuguang		Zheng		China	9/11/2001	VA (AA77)	
<u> </u>		<u> </u>		•			

	Claim Information	
Case	Complaint	Amendments & Substitutions
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3530	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3531	

	Sola	atium Dam	ages		
Relationship	Documentation	Prior Award		Amount	Treble
Child			\$	8,500,000.00	
Child			\$	8,500,000.00	

Exhibit B

EXHIBIT B NON-U.S. NATIONAL SOLATIUM - NEW YORK HED

	Claimant		9/11 Decedent				Claim Information			Solatium Damages							
First	Middle	Last	Suffix Nationality o	n First	Middle	Last	Suffix	Nationality on	Date of 9/11 Site	Case	Complaint	Amendments &	Relationship	Documentation	Prior	Amount	Treble
			9/11	1 1/2 11				9/11	Death		·	Substitutions	· ·		Award	d 12 500 000 00	
Maureen	Elizabeth	Basnicki Basnicki	Canada Canada	Kenneth Kenneth	William William	Basnicki Basnicki		Canada Canada	9/11/2001 NY (WTC) 9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3563 3 1:15-cv-09903, 717, at 1		Spouse Child			\$ 12,500,000.00 \$ 8,500,000.00	
Brennan Brent		McIntosh	Canada	Jane	vviiiiaiii	Beatty		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 717, at 1		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Drew	David	McIntosh	Canada	Jane		Beatty		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3608		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
						'		J	, , , ,		, ,					· , ,	
Malcolm	P.	Campbell	United Kingdor	n Geoffrey	Thomas	Campbell		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3157		Parent			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Catherine	Mary	Ross	United Kingdor	n Jeremy	Mark	Carrington		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3558		Parent			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Sarah	Jane	Carrington	United Kingdor	n Jeremy	Mark	Carrington		Ireland	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3561		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Grace	Elizabeth	Friend	Ireland	Joanne	Mary	Cregan		Ireland	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3014		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Mary	E.	Cregan	Ireland	Joanne	Mary	Cregan		Ireland	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3015		Parent			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Selena	Edna Irene	Dack-Forsyth	Canada	Caleb	Arron	Dack		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 104		Parent			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Helen	K.	Dawson	United Kingdor	n Anthony	Richard	Dawson		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3551		Parent			\$ 8,500,000.00	
David	C	De Vere	United Kingdor	n Melanie	Louiso	De Vere		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	0003	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3553		Daront			\$ 8,500,000.00	
David Ivonne	Pocasangre	Lopez	El Salvador	Ana	Louise Gloria	deBarrera	_	El Salvador	9/11/2001 NY (UA175)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3576		Parent Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Alvaro	i ocasarigi c	Dominguez	Australia	Alberto	Gioria	Dominguez		Australia	9/11/2001 NY		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3519		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Diego		Dominguez	Australia	Alberto		Dominguez		Australia	9/11/2001 NY		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3521		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Martha	I.	Dominguez	Australia	Alberto		Dominguez		Australia	9/11/2001 NY		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3517		Spouse			\$ 12,500,000.00	
Virginia	M.	Dominguez	Australia	Alberto		Dominguez		Australia	9/11/2001 NY		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3523		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Alberto		Dominguez	Australia	Alberto		Dominguez		Australia	9/11/2001 NY	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3518		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Angela		Ridge	United Visade	n Pohort	Douglas	Eaton		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	0000	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3190		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Angela		Ridge	United Kingdor	n Robert	Douglas	EatOII		omited kingdom	3/11/2001 NY (VVIC)	9903	11.17-rv-naano, 53, qt 31an		Sibililg			4,250,000.00 ç	
Barbara	J.	Stephenson	United Kingdor	n Robert	Douglas	Eaton		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3191		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Anna	Maria	Egan	Canada	Michael		Egan		Canada	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 579		Spouse			\$ 12,500,000.00	
Jonathan	Joseph	Egan	Ireland	Michael		Egan		Canada	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		1:15-cv-09903, 717, at 3		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Stephan	Joachim	Gerhardt	Canada	Ralph		Gerhardt		Canada	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3502		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Hans	J.	Gerhardt	Canada	Ralph		Gerhardt		Canada	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3501		Parent			\$ 8,500,000.00	
5	1	CILL	11.21.1122.11			CILL		III de la III de la III	0/44/2004 ANY (NA/TC)	0000	24.45					¢ 42.500.000.00	
Deena	Joan	Gilbey	United Kingdor	n Paul	Stuart	Gilbey		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 1416		Spouse			\$ 12,500,000.00	
Hannah	Jane Emily	Gilbey	United Kingdor	n Paul	Stuart	Gilbey		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 719, at 1		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Hamilan	Julie Ellilly	Glibey	Officed Kingdon	i i dai	Stuart	Gilbey		Omica Kingaom	3/11/2001 (11 (11 (11)	3303	1.13 ev 03303, 713, at 1		Cillia			\$ 0,500,000.00	
Colin	Vincent	Gilligan	United Kingdor	n Ronald	L.	Gilligan		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 2061		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Victoria		Blaksley	Argentina	Pedro		Grehan		Argentina	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 1727		Spouse			\$ 12,500,000.00	
Camila		Grehan	Argentina	Pedro		Grehan		Argentina	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 717, at 4		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Patricio	Brendan	Grehan	Argentina	Pedro		Grehan		Argentina	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 717, at 5		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Sofia		Grehan	Argentina	Pedro		Grehan		Argentina	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 717, at 6		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Susan		Jones	United Kingdor	n Christopher	D	Jones		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 2883		Spouse			\$ 12,500,000.00	
Liat		Levinhar	Israel	Shai	D.	Levinhar		Israel	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	_	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 2883		Spouse			\$ 12,500,000.00	
Dening		Lohez	China	Jerome		Lohez		France	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3509		Spouse			\$ 12,500,000.00	
J													·				
William	Luke	McNulty	United Kingdor	n Christine	Sheila	McNulty		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3589		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Catherine	Ann	McNulty	United Kingdor	n Christine	Sheila	McNulty		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3585		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Clive	Desmond	McNulty	United Kingdor	n Christine	Sheila	McNulty		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3586		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
CITYC	Desiriona	.vicivalty	Office Killguot	Cili istille	Officia	ivicivalty		omed Kinguoiii	3/ 11/ 2001 NT (VVIC)	3303	J_1.13 04 03303, 33, at 3300		Jibiilig			7,230,000.00	
Helen	Norah	McNulty	United Kingdor	n Christine	Sheila	McNulty		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3587		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
								-									
Michael	Bernard	McNulty	United Kingdor	n Christine	Sheila	McNulty		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3590		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
lan es	Et	NA-NI II AI			Ch. 2	NA AL TI		Hale June 1	0/44/2024 201/10/202	0.5.5	14.45 - 00000 50 : 5		C.T.I.			ć 4350.000.00	
Jennifer	Eileen	McNulty-Ahern	United Kingdor	n Christine	Sheila	McNulty		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3588		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
William	Jorn	Skead	United Kingdor	n Christine	Sheila	McNulty		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3584		Spouse			\$ 12,500,000.00	
77 man	30.11	JACAG	Office Kingdol	Cilistile	J. ICIIu	iviolitality		omea migaom	3/11/2001 NT (WTO)	3303			Spouse			- 12,300,000.00	
Tabitha	Belle McNulty	Skead	United Kingdor	n Christine	Sheila	McNulty		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		1:15-cv-09903, 717, at 7		Child			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Lachman		Parbhu	Guyana	Hardai		Parbhu		Guyana	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3537		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
								Trinidad and									
Parboti		Parbhu	Canada	Hardai		Parbhu	1	Tobago	9/11/2001 NY		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3541		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Gary	Moshe	Saada	France	Thierry		Saada		France	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3496		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Luis	5.	Samaniego Shefi	Paraguay	Carlos	Α.	Samaniego		Paraguay	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	_	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3490		Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00	
Yishai Pazit	Shefi	Sneti Baum	Israel Israel	Hagay Hagay		Shefi Shefi		Israel Israel	9/11/2001 NY (WTC) 9/11/2001 NY		3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3507 3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3506		Sibling Sibling			\$ 4,250,000.00 \$ 4,250,000.00	
. 4216	Jileii	Buum	131 001	Hagay		SHEII		israci	3/ 11/ 2001 141	3303	J 1.13 CV 03303, 33, at 3300		Sibillig			7,230,000.00	
						Cina addina		United Kingdom	9/11/2001 NY (UA175)	0003	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3486		Parent			¢ 0.500.000.00	
Ann		Simpkin	United Kingdor	n Jane	Louise	Simpkin		United Kingdom	3/11/2001 NI (OA1/3)	9903	5 1.13-CV-09903, 33, at 3460		I arciit			\$ 8,500,000.00	
Ann Britt		Simpkin Ehnar	United Kingdor Sweden	David	Louise	Tengelin		Sweden	9/11/2001 NY (WTC)	9903	3 1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3534		Parent			\$ 8,500,000.00	
					Louise					9903 9903							

Case 1:03-md-01570-GBD-SN Document 10756 Filed 03/03/25 Page 15 of 17

EXHIBIT B NON-U.S. NATIONAL SOLATIUM - NEW YORK HED

Lucy	E.	Thompson	United Kingdom
Maria	Teresa	Rueda De Torres	Columbia
Clive		Hopwood	United Kingdom
Julia	Ann	Wells	United Kingdom
Birgit	Margarete	Wiswe	Germany
Ajitha		Vemulapalli	India
Jean Marc		Saada	France
Rudy		Saada	France
Anthony		Saada	France
Cindy		Saada-Haddad	France
Rohy		Saada	France
Monica		Guzman	Columbia
Ronald	Patrick	Cregan	Ireland
William	C.	Wells	United Kingdom
Joanne		Cudmore	United Kingdom

					1
Clive		Thompson	United Kingdom	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)
Luis	Eduardo	Torres	Colombia	9/11/2001	
Luis	Eddardo	101163	Colombia	3/11/2001	ivi (vvic)
Dinah		Webster	United Kingdom	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)
Vincent	Michael	Wells	United Kingdom	9/11/2001	NY
Sigrid	Charlotte	Wiswe	Germany	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)
Suresh		Yanamadala	India	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)
Thierry		Saada	France	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)
Thierry		Saada	France	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)
Thierry		Saada	France	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)
Thierry		Saada	France	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)
Thierry		Saada	France	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)
Luis	Eduardo	Torres	Columbia	9/11/01	NY
Joanne	Mary	Cregan	Ireland	9/11/01	NY
Vincent	Michael	Wells	United Kingdom	9/11/01	NY
Neil	James	Cudmore	United Kingdom	9/11/01	NY

2222		
	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 1324	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3404	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3286	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3614	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 2875	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3543	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3497	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3500	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3494	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3495	
9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3499	
	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3405	
	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3016	
	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3616	
	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 3324	

			_
Spouse	\$	12,500,000.00	
Parent	\$	8,500,000.00	
Sibling	\$	4,250,000.00	
Parent	\$	8,500,000.00	
Sibling	\$	4,250,000.00	
Spouse	\$	12,500,000.00	
			\$ -
Parent	\$	8,500,000.00	
Sibling	\$	4,250,000.00	
			\$ -
Sibling	\$	4,250,000.00	

Exhibit C

Case 1:03-md-01570-GBD-SN Document 10756 Filed 03/03/25 Page 17 of 17

EXHIBIT C NON-U.S. NATIONAL FUNCTIONAL EQUIVALENT

		Claimant		
First	Middle	Last	Suffix	Nationality on 9/11
Erica		Zimmerman-Basnicki		Canada
Solomon		Gayle		Jamaica

			9/11 Dec	edent		
First	Middle	Last	Suffix	Nationality on 9/11	Date of Death	9/11 Site
Kenneth	William	Basnicki		Canada	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)
Seilai		Khoo		Malaysia	9/11/2001	NY (WTC)

I	Claim Information					
	Case	Complaint	Amendments & Substitutions			
	9903	1:15-cv-09903, 717, at 2				
	9903	1:15-cv-09903, 53, at 400				

Solatium Damages					
Relationship	Documentation	Prior		Amount	Treble
		Award			
Child			\$	8,500,000.00	
Spouse			\$	12,500,000.00	